Grading Criteria

Submissions will be graded using the below modfied Banfield grading criteria:

Category	Score (circle)
A. Importance	
High	4
Moderate	3
Limited	2
Low	1
B. Focus (ease of answering; PICO)	
Clearly focused and well-formed clinical question/PICO	4
Adequately focused question /PICO	3
Somewhat unfocused question /PICO	2
Inadequately focused question/PICO	1
Literature search	
C. Search process (including key words and databases used)	
Search process is of high quality with regard to being explicit, repeatable, and appropriate	4
Search process is of adequate quality with regard to being explicit, repeatable, and appropriate	3
Search process is of sub-optimal quality with regard to being explicit, repeatable, and appropriate	2
The search process is unlikely to yield appropriate papers	1
D. Appropriateness of evidence identified for inclusion	
The reports included are highly relevant (best evidence available to answer the question)	4
All reports are included	3
Effort was made to include only certain reports, but not the best ones to answer the question	2
The evidence selected does not answer the question	1
Critical appraisal	
E. Appropriateness (thoroughness) of appraisal	
Appraisal criteria used are appropriate and well addressed	4
Appraisal criteria used are mostly appropriate but some aspects were not evaluated	3
Appraisal criteria used are somewhat appropriate but key aspects were missed	2
Appraisal criteria are inappropriate	1
F. Appraisal accuracy	
Evidence is appropriately and succinctly summarised	4
Evidence is appropriately summarised for the most part, but the summary requires minor revision	3
Appraisal contains some misinterpretations, but is sufficiently summarised	2
Appraisal contains several misinterpretations	1
G. Conclusion (answer to the clinical question)	
An appropriate, clinically relevant conclusion is clearly stated	4
A somewhat clinically relevant but appropriate conclusion is clearly stated	3
A somewhat inappropriate conclusion is stated	2
A conclusion is not made or is inappropriate	1

H. Language, spelling, grammar	
Professional use of language, accurate spelling, correct use of grammar	2
Adequate use of language, some spelling errors, some incorrect use of grammar	1
Poor use of language, many spelling errors, poor use of grammar	0
TOTAL REVIEWER SCORE (Max 30)	

Modified from Reviewer Grading Criteria for Banfield Journal CAT Submissions