

EBVM Toolkit 2

Finding the best available evidence

There are five key steps to follow in Evidence-based Veterinary Medicine (EBVM). This handout offers advice on how to carry out the second step.

- 1. Asking an answerable clinical question
- 2. Finding the best available evidence to answer the question
- 3. Critically appraising the evidence for validity
- 4. Applying the results to clinical practice
- 5. Evaluating performance

Identifying synonyms

Once you have used PICO to identify the key concepts you are searching for, the next step is to identify synonyms and other related terms. Different authors may use different words to refer to the same concept so it is important to search for a variety of terms in order to reduce the chance of missing important research.

e.g. One piece of research might refer to **bitches** but another might refer to **dogs.**

Thinking about example in <u>EBVM Toolkit 1</u>: *Asking an answerable clinical question* an extended PICO could include the following keywords:

		Synonyms and other relevant keywords		
Patient or	adult bitches	dog	dogs	bitch
Population		bitches	canine	
Intervention	neutering	spaying	neutering	ovariohysterectomy
		ovariectomy	gonadectomy	
Comparison/Control	"no	not applicable		
	intervention"			
Outcome	mammary	mammary	breast	tumour
	tumours	cancer	neoplasia	neoplasm
		mass	lump	carcinoma

RCVS Knowledge Registered Office: RCVS Knowledge | First Floor | 10 Queen Street Place | London | EC4R 1BE Correspondence: RCVS Knowledge | 3 Waterhouse Square | 138-142 Holborn | London | EC1N 2SW **T 020 7202 0752 E** library@rcvsknowledge.org **W** www.rcvsknowledge.org

RCVS Knowledge is a registered Charity No. 230886. Registered as a Company limited by guarantee in England and Wales No. 598443.

Truncation

You then need to select the key search terms, remembering to think of alternative spellings and the different endings to words e.g. plurals that may have been used. See below where an asterisk indicates truncation.

See page 4 for more information on using truncation symbols

For example

Patient or	dog	dogs	bitch*	canine
Population				
Intervention	spay*	spey*	neuter*	ovariohysterectom*
	ovariectom*	gonadect*		
Comparison/control				
Outcome	mammar*	breast*	tumour*	tumor*
	cancer	cancers	neoplas*	mass
	masses	lump	lumps	carcinom*

Combining keywords

Then we need to think about how we would combine the keywords using AND, OR and NOT. See page 3 for more information on combining keywords.

For example	ļ
-------------	---

Patient or	(dog OR dogs OR bitch* OR canine)
Population	
Intervention	(spay* OR spey* OR neuter* OR ovariohysterectom* OR
	ovariectom* OR gonadect*)
Comparison/control	
Outcome	(mammar* OR breast*) AND (tumour*
	OR tumor* OR cancer OR cancers OR neoplas* OR mass OR
	masses OR lump OR lumps OR carcinom*)

You need to be careful how you combine the keywords as different combinations will produce different results.

Some databases have an advanced search option which allows you to save searches and combine them to construct more complicated searches line by line.

Building the search line by line helps you to minimise errors and capture the thought process. The table below shows how to do this

gonadect*)ovariohysterectomiesgonadectomygonadectomizedgonadectomizegonadectomisedgonadectomisedgonadectomised3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords:breast4(tumour*or tumor*)references containing keywords:umor4(tumour*or tumor*)tumourtumourstumoror cancer or cancers or neoplas*tumorscancerscancersor mass or masses or lump or lumpsneoplasmneoplasmsneoplasiaor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomasBesult will retrieveInnex will give youdifferent sets of results1 and 2 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumoursInnex will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours	Search	Search strategy	y Result will retrieve			
bitch* or canine)dog bitchesdogs canine2(spay* or spey* or neuter* or ovariohysterectom* gonadect*)references containing keywords: spayspayed spaying speying speying speying3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords: or cancer or tumour*gonadectomize gonadectgonadectomized gonadectomized4(tumour* or tumor* or cancer or or mass or masses or lump or lumps or carcinom*)references containing keywords: tumorstumor tumor tumourCombining the search lines will give you differett sets of resultsResult will retrieve will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1 and 2 and 4 und 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary	line					
2(spay* or spey* or neuter* or ovariohysterectom* gonadect*)references containing keywords: spay ovariohysterectom* ovariohysterectomized gonadect*)spay speying ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomize gonadectomize gonadectomizespay speying ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomize gonadectomized gonadectomizespay speying ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomize gonadectomize gonadectomizespay speying ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomize gonadectomized gonadectomize3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords: breastsbreast4(tumour*or tumor* or cancer or or massor masses or lump or lumps or carcinom*)references containing keywords: tumorstumor cancer cancers6or cancer or or massor masses or lump or lumps or carcinom*)neoplasm mass massesneoplasia neoplasms neoplasia71 and 2 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords with mammary tumours1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning over neutered1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning over with mammary tumours1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours1 and 3 and 4will gi	1	(dog or dogs or	references containing keywords:			
2 (spay* or spey* or neuter* or spay references containing keywords: neuter* or ovariohysterectom* or ovariohysterectomized or ovariohysterectomise gonadectomy ovariohysterectomize gonadectomized gonadectomize spay speying speyed 3 (mammar* or feferences containing keywords: or animary mammary mammaries breast 4 (tumour* or tumor*) references containing keywords: tumor tumor 5 or cancer or or ansso or masses neoplasm neoplasms neoplasia or carcinom*) lumps cancer or acarcinoma carcinomas carcinomas 0 or carcinom*) lumps carcinoma carcinomas 0 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily mammary		bitch* or canine)	dog	dogs	bitch	
neuter* or ovariohysterectom*spay spey speyingspayedovariohysterectom* or ovariedtom* or gonadect*)ovariohysterectomy ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomized gonadectomizedovariohysterectomized gonadectomized3(mammar* or breast*)references containing k=ywords:spey4(tumour* or tumoor* or cancer or or mass or masses or lump or lumpreferences containing k=ywords:tumor4or cancer or or mass or masses or lump or lump or lumptumorscancer masscancersCombining the search lifters werd or cancersmassmasseslump1 and 2 and 3 and 4 in and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily tumoursin and 3 and 41 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily tumoms			bitches	canine		
ovariohysterectom* or ovariectom* or gonadect*)spey speyspeying speyingspeyed3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords: mammary breastsgonadectomized gonadectomizedgonadectomized gonadectomized4(tumour*or tumor* cancer or or cancer or or mass or masses or lump or lumps or carcinom*)references containing keywords: tumorstumor tumor0umpneoplasmsneoplasmsneoplasia0or carcinom*)lumps carcinomacarcinomasCombining the search lines will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours1and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered	2	(spay* or spey* or	references containing	keywords:		
or ovariectom* or gonadect*) ovariohysterectomy ovariohysterectomies gonadectomize ovariohysterectomized gonadectomized gonadectomized gonadectomised ovariohysterectomised gonadectomized gonadectomised 3 (mammar* or breast*) references containing keywords: breasts breast 4 (tumour*or tumor* cancer or cancers or neoplas* or lump or lumps or carcinom*) references containing keywords: tumors tumor or anso or masses or lump or lumps or carcinom*) neoplasms neoplasms neoplasia 1 and 2 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours und 1 he listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary		neuter* or	spay	spaying	spayed	
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c } \mbod {a} \mbod {b} \mbod {a} \mbod {b} \mbod {a} $		ovariohysterectom*	spey	speying	speyed	
abbbb3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords: breastsbreastbreast4(tumour* or tumor* or cancer or cancers or neoplas* or mass or masses or lump or lumpsreferences containing keywords: tumorstumor6(tumour*or tumor* tumour*tumourstumor7(tumour* or tumor* or cancer or cancerseancer neoplasmscancers0reforences concerning*neoplasmsneoplasia0nump or lumps umpsmasseslump0carcinom*lumpscarcinoma0reforences containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumoursseconcerning all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours1and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		or ovariectom* or	ovariohysterectomy	ovariohysterectomized	ovariohysterectomised	
3(mammar* or breast*)references containing keywords: mammarymammariesbreast4(tumour*or tumor*)references containing keywords: tumour*tumour*or tumourstumour*or4(tumour*or tumor*)references containing keywords: tumourtumourtumour*oror cancer or cancers or neoplas*tumour*tumourstumor*oror mass or masses 		gonadect*)	ovariohysterectomies	gonadectomy	gonadectomized	
breast*)mammarymammariesbreast4(tumour*or tumor*)references containing keywords:5or cancer ortumourtumourscancers or neoplas*tumorscanceror mass or massesneoplasmneoplasmsor lump or lumpsmassmassesor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomalines will give youKesult will retrieveretrievedifferertsKesult will retrieveretrievelines will give youkill give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumourssconcerning all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1 and 2 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differences1 and 3 and 4will give references but not necessarily mammary1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differences1 and 3 and 4will give references but not necessarily tumoursi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning differencesi			gonadectomize	gonadectomised	gonadectomise	
Image: Normal set in the se	3	(mammar* or	references containing	keywords:		
4(tumour*or tumor*)references containing kerrors:4(tumour*or tumor*)tumourtumourstumoursor cancer ortumourtumourscancercancerscancers or neoplas*tumorscancercancersneoplasiaor mass or massesneoplasmneoplasmsneoplasianeoplasiaor lump or lumpsmassmasseslumpdimentionor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomascarcinomasImes will give youResult will retrievevelocityvelocitydifferert sets of resultssets of resultssets of concerning1 and 2 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerningneutered dogs with tumours1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning on untered dogs with tumourswith mammary tumours1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning on untered dogs with tumours but not necessarily tumours1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogswith mammary tumoury tumoury tumoury but not necessarily tumourswith mammary tumoury		breast*)	mammary	mammaries	breast	
or cancer ortumourtumourstumorcancers or neoplas*tumorscancercancersor mass or massesneoplasmneoplasmsneoplasmsor lump or lumpsmassmasseslumpor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomasor carcinom*)Result will retrievecarcinomacarcinomasInnes will give references concerning all the listed key or soncerningneutered dogs with marmary tumoursI and 2 and 3 and 4will give references concerning all the listed key or soncerningneutered dogs with marmary tumoursI and 3 and 4will give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning or soncerning or soncerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concerning all the listed key or soncerning dogswill give references concernin			breasts			
cancers or neoplas*tumorscancercancersor mass or massesneoplasmneoplasmsneoplasinsor lump or lumpsmassmasseslumpor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomaBesult will retrieveIntersearchResult will give references colspan="4">IntersearchIntersearchNill give references colspan="4">IntersearchIntersearch<	4	(tumour*or tumor*	references containing l	keywords:		
or mass or masses or lump or lumpsneoplasm massneoplasms massesneoplasiaor carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomasCombining the search lines will give you differetiveResult will retrieveInterset or resultsInterset of resultsI and 2 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumoursI and 2 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammaryI and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neuteredI and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		or cancer or	tumour	tumours	tumor	
or lump or lumps or carcinom*)mass lumpsmasses carcinomalumpCombi		cancers or neoplas*	tumors	cancer	cancers	
or carcinom*)lumpscarcinomacarcinomasCombining the search lines will give you different sets of resultsResult will retrieve1 and 2 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours1 and 2 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		or mass or masses	neoplasm	neoplasms	neoplasia	
Combining the search lines will give you different sets of resultsResult will retrieve1 and 2 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours1 and 2 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours1 and 2 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary1 and 3 and 4will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		or lump or lumps	mass	masses	lump	
lines will give you intersection different sets of results intersection 1 and 2 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours 1 and 2 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		or carcinom*)	lumps	carcinoma	carcinomas	
different sets of results 1 and 2 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours 1 and 2 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered	Combining the search		Result will retrieve			
1 and 2 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with mammary tumours 1 and 2 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered	lines wi	ll give you				
Image: second	differen	nt sets of results				
1 and 2 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		1 and 2 and 3 and 4	will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning			
1 and 3 and 4 neutered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary 1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered			neutered dogs with mammary tumours			
1 and 3 and 4 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered		1 and 2 and 4	will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning			
with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been neutered	neutered		neutered dogs with tur	ered dogs with tumours but not necessarily mammary		
neutered		1 and 3 and 4	will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning dogs			
			with mammary tumours but not necessarily those that have been			
1 and 2 will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning			neutered			
		1 and 2	will give references containing all the listed keywords concerning			
neutering and dogs			neutering and dogs			

(1 and 2) or (1 and	will give references on neutering and dogs or dogs with mammary
3 and 4)	tumours

Search tools

Boolean operators

Boolean operators allow you to combine or exclude terms in a search. This will save time and effort by eliminating unsuitable or inappropriate hits from the results

AND	both terms need to be in the record before it	animal AND cruelty
	is returned, it therefore narrows a search	
OR	either (or both) terms will be in the record,	kidney OR renal
	it therefore broadens a search	
NOT	the first term is searched and then any	horse* NOT horseradish
	records containing the term after the NOT	
	are excluded, it therefore narrows a	
	search. Care should be taken as it is easy to	
	exclude good records	
Parenthesis	use brackets	dialysis AND (kidney OR
	() to group order of search	renal)

Other search tools

Most databases and search engines offer other tools that allow you to search more effectively, for example: truncation symbols, wildcards, etc.

The following is a selection of commonly used tools. If they do not work as expected you should check the "help" or "search tips" of the database you are using.

Phrase	use quote marks " " to find exact phrases	"foot and mouth"
searching		will return results containing the
		exact phrase "foot and mouth"
		but not those just containing
		"foot" or "mouth"
Truncation	using an asterisk * at the end of a word will	transplant*
	return all words that start with the stem	will return transplant,
		transplantation, transplanted,
		transplanting etc
	using an asterisk * at the beginning of a	*glycemia
	word will return all words that end with the	will return hyperglycemia,
	stem	hypoglycemia
Wildcard	use ? in place of a single unknown character	leuk?mia will return leukemia
	use ?? in place of 2 characters	leuk??mia will return leukaemia

Choosing which databases to search

Once you have defined your search strategy you then need to decide which databases to search.

Research¹ shows that the coverage by bibliographic databases of veterinary journals and journals that regularly have veterinary content varies greatly. CAB Abstracts has the highest coverage (90.2%) whilst Medline (PubMed) only has 36.5%.

Therefore to ensure that you retrieve as much of the published evidence on your topic as possible you should use CAB Abstracts and then at least one other database of your choosing. If you only use Medline (PubMed) you risk ignoring 64.5% of all journals with veterinary content. If you only use Google or Google Scholar you will probably get thousands of hits of very little relevance to you.

If you are carrying out a search as part of a review or critical appraisal of available literature for publication you should check if the publisher has minimum requirements for databases searched.

¹ Grindlay, D.et al (2012) Searching the veterinary literature: a comparison of the coverage of veterinary journals by nine bibliographic databases. *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 39 (4), pp. 404-412. DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.3138/jvme.1111.109R</u>

For example a search for a Knowledge Summary for publication in <u>Veterinary Evidence</u> must include CAB Abstracts 1973-current and PubMed as a minimum.

Databases with veterinary coverage

Name of	Publisher	Description
database		
CAB Abstracts	CABI	Applied life sciences database covering veterinary
		sciences, agriculture, environment, applied
		economics, food science and nutrition
Medline	US National Library	Life Sciences database covering biomedicine.
(PubMed)	of Medicine	Often referred to as PubMed as freely available via
		the PubMed website. Includes links to full text
		content from PubMed Central where available.
Scopus	Elsevier	Multidisciplinary bibliographic and citation
		database
VetMed	CABI	Veterinary Sciences database containing the
Resource		bibliographic records from CAB Abstracts, full
		text documents, specially written reviews etc
Web of Science	Thomson Reuters	Multidisciplinary bibliographic and citation
		database including Science Citation Index, and
		other content

Locating full-text articles

In order to critically appraise the evidence for validity (step 3 of EBVM), you should examine the full-text article rather than relying on the abstract. Reading the abstract may tell you whether an article is relevant but it will not tell you whether the methodology and conclusions are reliable. <u>EBVM Toolkit</u> Numbers 3 through to 15 will show you how to appraise the evidence

Where can you find the full-text articles?

Is it free?

Some articles can be found **free on the web** e.g. by searching Pubmed or Google Scholar. Some full-text articles are also available from publishers' websites and Open Access repositories. However, the majority of veterinary articles are behind paywalls and cannot be accessed without a subscription.

Does your institution or employer provide access?

If you are a member of an academic institution or professional association, you may be able to access full-text articles using their library resources. Additionally, some employers will subscribe to journals on their employees' behalves.

Do you have an individual subscription?

In some cases you may have a personal subscription to the journal. However, personally subscribing to all relevant journals is costly and likely to be an uneconomical way of practicing EBVM.

Have you tried the RCVS Knowledge Library and Information Service?

Members of RCVS Knowledge Library have access to most veterinary journals, including *Veterinary Clinics of North America, JAVMA* and *Veterinary Surgery*, Membership of RCVS Knowledge Library gives you an economical and efficient way of accessing the evidence you need.

If we do not provide access to the article you need, we can usually get it from another library (your academic institution may also provide this service). Even if you're not a member, RCVS Knowledge Library can provide you with copies of articles at a cheaper rate than most pay-per-article options on publisher websites.

Further assistance

- If you need further help then contact RCVS Knowledge Information Specialists on https://library@rcvsknowledge.org or 020 7202 0752.
- Literature searching workshops: we offer online workshops on a one-to-one basis covering how to focus a search question, database searching and making the most of our resources

Learning resources: our <u>EBVM for Practitioners</u>, <u>EBVM Learning course</u>, <u>Farm Vet Champions</u> <u>course</u> and additional resources provide easily accessible guidance for those looking to apply evidence-based principles to their work. EBVM Toolkit 2: Finding the best available evidence by <u>RCVS Knowledge</u> is licensed under

a Creative Commons Attribution-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License.

We welcome comments and suggestions for improvement to this guide.

Please email ebvm@rcvsknowledge.org